

Review of Proposals
RFP 4-2217 On-Call Real Property Appraisals and Related Services
 Presented to Regional Transportation Planning Committee - November 4, 2024
 13 proposals were received, 5 firms were interviewed, 3 firms are being recommended

Overall Ranking	Overall Score	Firm & Location	Subcontractors	Evaluation Committee Comments	Weighted Average Hourly Rate
1	85	R.P. Laurain & Associates, Inc. Long Beach, California	Desmond, Marcello & Amster, LLC Hodges Lacey & Associates, LLC	Firm was founded in 1969 and services include appraising all types of commercial, industrial, and residential properties for large, multi-parcel infrastructure projects. Experience includes providing appraisal services for government agencies, including the Orange County Transportation Authority (OCTA), Port of Long Beach, California Department of Transportation (Caltrans), California High Speed Rail Authority (CHSRA), County of Orange, and Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority. Proposed project manager has over 30 years of real estate appraisal experience including eminent domain studies, street widening, grade separation, freeway projects, railroad projects, relocation studies, and leasing of publicly-owned properties. Proposed project team has an average of 19 years of experience in market research and real estate appraisal. Demonstrated an understanding of the appraisal process as a whole and described the quality control/quality assurance (QC/QA) measures the firm implements for every project, including project manager involvement at every stage of the assignment. Demonstrated previous experience working with Caltrans appraisal reviewers and a thorough understanding of the Caltrans Right-of-Way (ROW) manual. Presented an in-depth technical approach and provided detailed responses to questions during the interview.	\$213
2	84	Hennessey & Hennessey, LLC Tustin, California	Easley & Associates Desmond, Marcello & Amster, LLC Hodges, Lacey & Associates, LLC Document All Stars	Firm was founded in 1979 and services include providing real estate appraisal, appraisal for eminent domain, appraisal of properties for negotiated acquisitions surplus property dispositions, appraisal review, and consulting services. Firm has experience providing appraisal services for government agencies, including OCTA, the cities of Anaheim and Santa Ana, and the Riverside County Transportation Commission. Proposed project manager has over 35 years of real property appraisal experience with an emphasis on eminent domain and litigation appraisals. Proposed project team has ten to 30 years of experience and have worked on projects of similar size and scope. Demonstrated an understanding of the appraisal process as a whole and described the QC/QA the firm implements for every project, including the use of subconsultant for proof reading. Demonstrated previous experience working with Caltrans appraisal reviewers and a thorough understanding of the Caltrans ROW manual. Presented an in-depth technical approach and provided detailed responses to questions during the interview.	\$201
2	84	Santolucito Dore Group, Inc. Encino, California	Donna Desmond Associates Hodges, Lacey & Associates, LLC	Firm was founded in 2015 and services include providing real estate appraisal and consultation services. Proposed project team has 18-40 years of experience. Firm has experience providing appraisal services for government agencies including: OCTA, City of Irvine, County of Orange, Los Angeles World Airports, and CHSRA. Proposed project manager has over 18 years of experience in real estate appraisal, specializing in public agency and complex appraisal assignments. Demonstrated an understanding of the appraisal process as a whole and described the firm's Excel Master Tracking Spreadsheet and project binder for QC/QA and to ensure projects are delivered on time. Demonstrated a thorough understanding of compliance with the Caltrans ROW manual. Presented an in-depth technical approach and provided detailed responses to questions during the interview.	\$249
3	79	Hendrickson Appraisal Company, Inc. San Diego, California	Desmond, Marcello & Amster, LLC	Firm was founded in 1986 and services include providing consultation services relating to the real estate and real property appraisals. Proposed project team has an average of 25 years of experience providing valuation services. Firm has experience providing appraisal services for government agencies, including OCTA, City of Irvine, County of Orange, and City of Anaheim. Proposed project manager has over 18 years of experience in real estate appraisal, specializing in ROW appraisal and expert witness testimonial. Other proposed staff has 38 years of experience specializing in agency appraisal and consulting. Explained the general process of completing appraisals, including typical timelines. Explained the importance of complying with Uniform Standard Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) guidelines. Demonstrated a thorough understanding of compliance with the Caltrans ROW manual. Proposed project manager presented in-depth technical approach and provided a general overview of the firm's QC/QA process.	\$223

Review of Proposals
RFP 4-2217 On-Call Real Property Appraisals and Related Services
Presented to Regional Transportation Planning Committee - November 4, 2024

13 proposals were received, 5 firms were interviewed, 3 firms are being recommended

Overall Ranking	Overall Score	Firm & Location	Subcontractors	Evaluation Committee Comments	Weighted Average Hourly Rate
4	77	Epic Land Solutions, Inc. Riverside, California	Donna Desmond Associates Hodges, Lacey & Associates, LLC	<p>Firm was founded in 2000 and services include providing real estate appraisal for local public agencies, utilities, design engineers, and environmental companies.</p> <p>Firm has experience providing appraisal services for government agencies, including OCTA, County of Orange, South Coast Water District, Orange County Water District, City of Anaheim, City of Irvine, and City of Fullerton.</p> <p>Proposed project manager has over 36 years of experience in the valuation of various property types. Other staff has 11 years of experience in general real estate.</p> <p>Provided a detailed overview of the general appraisal process, appraisal reviews, furniture, fixtures and equipment, and goodwill.</p> <p>Demonstrated a thorough understanding of compliance with the USPAP guidelines and the Caltrans ROW manual.</p> <p>The proposed project manager explained the firm's three-tier QC/QA process to ensure the accuracy and completion of each report.</p>	\$180

Evaluation Panel: Five Members

Internal:
Contracts Administration and Materials Management (1)
Real Property (2)
Capital Programs (1)
Project Development (1)

Evaluation Criteria:

Qualifications of the Firm
Staffing and Project Organization
Work Plan
Cost and Price

Weight Factors

30%
25%
20%
25%