



July 6, 2020

To: Regional Planning and Highways Committee

From: Darrell E. Johnson, Chief Executive Officer 

Subject: Consultant Selection for the Preparation of Plans, Specifications, and Estimates for the State Route 91 Improvement Project Between Acacia Street and La Palma Avenue

Overview

On March 9, 2020, the Orange County Transportation Authority Board of Directors approved the release of a request for proposals for the preparation of plans, specifications, and estimates for the State Route 91 improvement project between Acacia Street and La Palma Avenue. Board of Directors' approval is requested for the selection of a firm to perform the required work.

Recommendations

- A. Approve the selection of T.Y. Lin International as the firm to prepare the plans, specifications, and estimates for the State Route 91 improvement project between Acacia Street and La Palma Avenue.
- B. Authorize the Chief Executive Officer to negotiate and execute Agreement No. C-0-2073 between the Orange County Transportation Authority and T.Y. Lin International to prepare the plans, specifications, and estimates for the State Route 91 improvement project between Acacia Street and La Palma Avenue.

Discussion

State Route 91 (SR-91) improvements between State Route 57 (SR-57) and State Route 55 (SR-55) (Project) are part of Project I in the Measure M2 (M2) freeway program. In the updated Next 10 Delivery Plan, adopted by the Orange County Transportation Authority (OCTA) Board of Directors (Board) in November 2019, the Project is listed as one of the M2 freeway projects to be cleared through the environmental process and to move into design using net excess 91 Express Lanes revenue.

Consultant Selection for the Preparation of Plans, Specifications, and Estimates for the State Route 91 Improvement Project Between Acacia Street and La Palma Avenue

Page 2

The Project will add a general purpose lane in the eastbound direction between La Palma Avenue and SR-55, and provide westbound (WB) operational improvements between Acacia Street and La Palma Avenue, and between SR-55 and Lakeview Avenue. The Project includes reconstruction of the La Palma Avenue overcrossing bridge, and reconstruction of the Kraemer Boulevard/Glassell Street, Lakeview Avenue, and Tustin Avenue interchanges.

The final environmental document approved in June 2020 identifies the build alternative as the preferred alternative to be implemented. Therefore, the Project is ready to proceed into the final design phase. The Project is being developed as three separate design and construction projects to enhance the participation and competitive bidding of consultants and contractors, with the following Project limits:

- Segment 1 extends from SR-55 to Lakeview Avenue
- Segment 2 extends from La Palma Avenue to SR-55
- Segment 3 extends from Acacia Street to La Palma Avenue

Procurement Approach

This procurement for Segment 3 was handled in accordance with OCTA's Board-approved procedures for architectural and engineering (A&E) services that conform to both state and federal laws. Proposals are evaluated and ranked in accordance with the qualifications of the firm, staffing and project organization, and work plan. As this is an A&E procurement, price is not an evaluation criterion pursuant to state and federal laws. Evaluation of the proposals was conducted on the basis of overall qualifications to develop a competitive range of offerors. The highest-ranked firm is requested to submit a cost proposal, and the final agreement is negotiated. Should negotiations fail with the highest-ranked firm, a cost proposal will be solicited from the second-ranked firm in accordance with Board-approved procurement policies.

On March 9, 2020, the Board authorized the release of Request for Proposals (RFP) 0-2073 for Segment 3, which was electronically issued on CAMM NET. The Project was advertised on March 9 and March 16, 2020, in a newspaper of general circulation. A pre-proposal conference was held on March 16, 2020, with 22 attendees representing 14 firms. Three addenda were issued to make available the pre-proposal conference registration sheets, provide responses to questions received, and handle administrative issues related to the RFP.

Consultant Selection for the Preparation of Plans, Specifications, and Estimates for the State Route 91 Improvement Project Between Acacia Street and La Palma Avenue **Page 3**

On April 8, 2020, four proposals were received. An evaluation committee consisting of members from OCTA's Contracts Administration and Materials Management and Highway Programs departments, as well as external representatives from the California Department of Transportation (Caltrans) and the City of Anaheim, met to review all submitted proposals. The proposals were evaluated utilizing the following Board-approved evaluation criteria and weightings:

- | | |
|-------------------------------------|------------|
| • Qualifications of the Firm | 25 percent |
| • Staffing and Project Organization | 40 percent |
| • Work Plan | 35 percent |

The evaluation criteria and weightings are consistent with those developed for similar A&E procurements. In developing these weightings, several factors were considered, giving the greatest importance to staffing and project organization of the firm, as the qualifications of the project manager and other key personnel are very important to the successful and timely delivery of the Project. Similarly, high importance was given to the work plan criterion to emphasize the importance of the team's understanding of the Project, its challenges, and its approach to implementing the various elements of the scope of work (SOW). The technical approach to the Project is critical to the successful performance of the Project. The final criterion, qualifications of the firm, evaluated the firm's experience in performing work of similar scope and size.

The evaluation committee reviewed all proposals based on the evaluation criteria and found two firms most qualified to perform the required services. The most qualified firms are listed below in alphabetical order:

Firm and Location

AECOM Technical Services, Inc. (AECOM)
Orange, California

T.Y. Lin International (TY Lin)
Irvine, California

On May 28, 2020, the evaluation committee interviewed the two firms. The interviews consisted of a presentation allowing each team to present its qualifications, highlight its proposal, and respond to evaluation committee questions. Each firm also highlighted its staffing plan, work plan, and perceived Project challenges. Each firm was asked general questions related to qualifications, relevant experience, Project organization, and approach to the

work plan. In addition, each firm was asked specific questions regarding the team's approach to the requirements of the SOW, management of the Project, coordination with various agencies, experience with similar projects, and the team's solutions toward achieving the Project goals. After considering responses to the questions asked during the interview, the evaluation committee adjusted the preliminary scores for one of the two firms; however, TY Lin remained as the top-ranked firm with the highest cumulative score.

Based on the evaluation of written proposals and information obtained during the interviews, staff recommends TY Lin as the top-ranked firm to prepare the plans, specifications, and estimates (PS&E) for the Project. TY Lin's proposal received the highest ranking, largely due to the team's successful management and implementation of recent and relevant PS&E projects of similar scale and scope, the firm's comprehensive understanding of the Project objectives and constraints, and presentation of relevant technical solutions that consider far-reaching improvements of the transportation system beyond the limits of this segment. The firm demonstrated a thorough understanding of the Project requirements and presented a detailed work plan addressing key issues that are critical to the success of the Project. The following is a brief summary of the proposal evaluation results.

Qualifications of the Firm

Both firms are well established with recent and relevant experience and are qualified to perform the services.

TY Lin, founded in 1954, is a full-service infrastructure engineering firm. TY Lin has 2,900 employees in 50 offices across the Americas and Asia, including 130 employees and four offices in southern California, one of which is in the City of Irvine. The firm has delivered over 200 freeway and highway projects throughout California, including numerous PS&E projects of similar complexity, and has experience working with local corridor cities. Recent relevant firm experience includes the PS&E for the Interstate 5 (I-5) high-occupancy vehicle (HOV) improvement project from SR-55 to SR-57 for OCTA, State Route 241 (SR-241)/Oso Parkway interchange for the Transportation Corridor Agencies (TCA), Interstate 215 (I-215)/Placentia Avenue interchange for the Riverside County Transportation Commission (RCTC), and Interstate 15 (I-15)/French Valley Parkway interchange for the City of Temecula. TY Lin's experience on these projects demonstrated leadership, technical expertise, stakeholder coordination with various stakeholders, familiarity with Caltrans' processes and requirements, and the ability to deliver PS&E projects with similar scope.

AECOM, founded in 1927, provides project management, engineering, and other professional services to the transportation industry. AECOM has offices worldwide and locally, with 1,800 professionals working in six offices in southern California. AECOM has experience with PS&E projects in southern California, including the I-5 HOV widening project from Avenida Vista Hermosa to Pacific Coast Highway (Segment 2) and the I-5 widening project approval/environmental document (PA/ED) project from Interstate 405 (I-405) to SR-55 for OCTA, and State Route 210 (SR-210) widening and SR-210/Base Line interchange projects for San Bernardino County Transportation Authority.

Staffing and Project Organization

Both short-listed firms proposed qualified project managers, key personnel, and subconsultants with relevant PS&E experience in interchange and freeway widening projects.

TY Lin proposed a qualified project team with relevant comprehensive experience and understanding of the Project issues, risks, and challenges. The team is proficient in various disciplines required for the Project and has extensive recent Caltrans experience. The team has demonstrated experience working on projects of similar size and scope with a track record of accelerated project delivery and a below average number of design-related change orders during construction, demonstrating a well-vetted design. The proposed project manager has 26 years of experience and has delivered nearly 50 Caltrans PS&E projects, with 12 in Orange County, and nearly 90 interchanges throughout southern California. The proposed roadway lead has over 11 years of experience and functioned as deputy project manager and technical manager for recently delivered PS&E relevant projects. The proposed roadway lead also has identified innovative and cost-saving solutions that minimize right-of-way (ROW) and environmental impacts for those recently delivered PS&E projects. The roadway lead has been successful in obtaining approval from Caltrans for design standard decision documents, which are required to document engineering decisions regarding design features that deviate from Caltrans standards to minimize ROW and environmental impacts. The proposed structures lead has 25 years of experience with all technical aspects of structures from conceptual design to construction, including approval of complex bridge structures and innovative cost-effective solutions through Caltrans' bridge structures design selection process.

The proposed TY Lin leads have recent experience working together. TY Lin's proposed project team demonstrated relevant experience delivering OCTA and Caltrans PS&E projects, including the I-5 HOV improvement project from SR-55 to SR-57 for OCTA, SR-241/Oso Parkway interchange for TCA,

I-215/Placentia Avenue interchange for RCTC, and I-15/French Valley Parkway interchange for the City of Temecula. The TY Lin team includes traffic engineering and operations personnel from Jacobs Engineering Group, Inc., where its expertise played a key role in traffic operations and developing traffic management plans, which included evaluation of traffic impacts during multiple construction stages for relevant projects.

AECOM proposed a project team and key personnel with relevant experience in PA/ED and PS&E projects in southern California. The proposed project manager has more than 30 years of experience and has managed projects throughout southern California. The proposed roadway lead has 21 years of experience in design and planning of highway and roadway projects in southern California. The structures lead has 36 years of experience in civil and structural engineering on a wide range of transportation infrastructure projects, including bridge, highway, heavy rail, and facilities projects. The team's recent relevant experience includes the I-5 HOV widening PA/ED between SR-55 and SR-57, I-5 widening PA/ED between I-405 and SR-55, State Route 60/Central Avenue interchange PS&E, and I-15/Base Line Road interchange PS&E. The AECOM team includes a designated Caltrans liaison from Advanced Civil Technologies, Inc., which has relevant local experience. The organization chart for AECOM also shows the quality manager reporting to the project manager, which may impact the authority and ability of the quality manager to independently perform the duties. AECOM's proposed staffing assumes approval of its proposal to eliminate ROW acquisitions, which may not be feasible.

Work Plan

Both short-listed firms met the requirements of the RFP, and each firm adequately discussed its approach to the Project.

TY Lin presented a comprehensive and viable work plan that demonstrated an understanding of the Project design requirements, constraints, challenges, and risks. TY Lin presented innovative solutions that propose savings to construction costs, schedule, and ROW while optimizing traffic operations. One of the proposed innovative solutions keeps the WB SR-91/northbound SR-57 and WB SR-91/southbound SR-57 connectors together, similar to the existing condition, while providing geometric improvements and traffic operational improvements meeting Caltrans design requirements, potentially saving many months from the schedule and saving construction costs by eliminating a tunnel structure and shortening retaining walls. The proposed solution provides operational benefits beyond the project limits. This innovative solution as well

as other proposed design refinements eliminate ROW needs and non-standard features, and minimize constructability issues.

The detailed work plan identified potential project risk items, accompanied by mitigation plans, and discussed corridor coordination elements that are key to the success of projects delivered in multiple segments. The work plan sought to minimize impacts to the local community, and analyzed constructability by considering construction staging and construction challenges. The overall approaches to Project execution described in the work plan and presented during the interview included a thorough discussion of disciplines that are critical for successful PS&E performance and provided a roadmap to deliver the Project. The interview confirmed the technical knowledge and expertise of the TY Lin team and its inclusive understanding of Project challenges, risks, and requirements, including modeling and analysis of the traffic operational improvements needed in the Project area. The TY Lin team demonstrated in-depth knowledge of its proposed approach to the SOW and provided detailed responses to all interview questions.

AECOM presented a work plan that included the Project SOW, goals, and challenges. The work plan discussed Project issues not identified in the draft project report and included an organized presentation of solutions to these issues and concerns. The work plan also proposed enhancements that potentially eliminate all the ROW requirements for this segment, potentially saving many months from the schedule and costs, which may not be feasible. Some key Project challenges associated with traffic operational deficiency and local community impacts were not fully addressed. In addition, schedule savings proposed were explained in general terms. AECOM's civil lead, geometric lead, and Caltrans liaison were responsive to the interview questions.

Procurement Summary

Based on the evaluation of the written proposals, team qualifications, and information obtained during the interviews, the evaluation committee recommends the selection of TY Lin as the top-ranked firm to prepare the PS&E for the SR-91 improvement project between Acacia Street and La Palma Avenue.

Fiscal Impact

The Project is included in OCTA's Fiscal Year 2020-21 Budget, Capital Programs Division, Account 0017-7519-FI104-0U9, and will be funded through net excess 91 Express Lanes revenue.

Consultant Selection for the Preparation of Plans, Specifications, and Estimates for the State Route 91 Improvement Project Between Acacia Street and La Palma Avenue **Page 8**

Summary

Staff requests Board of Directors' approval for the Chief Executive Officer to negotiate and execute Agreement No. C-0-2073 with T.Y. Lin International as the firm to prepare the plans, specifications, and estimates for the State Route 91 improvement project between Acacia Street and La Palma Avenue.

Attachments

- A. Review of Proposals, RFP 0-2073 Consultant Services for the Preparation of Plans, Specifications, and Estimates for the State Route 91 Improvement Project Between Acacia Street and La Palma Avenue
- B. Proposal Evaluation Criteria Matrix (Short-Listed), RFP 0-2073 Consultant Services for the Preparation of Plans, Specifications, and Estimates for the State Route 91 Improvement Project Between Acacia Street and La Palma Avenue
- C. Contract History for the Past Two Years, RFP 0-2073 Consultant Services for the Preparation of Plans, Specifications, and Estimates for the State Route 91 Improvement Project Between Acacia Street and La Palma Avenue

Prepared by:



Jeannie Lee, P.E.
Senior Project Manager
(714) 560-5735

Approved by:



James G. Beil, P.E.
Executive Director, Capital Programs
(714) 560-5646



Virginia Abadessa
Director, Contracts Administration and
Materials Management
(714) 560-5623