

Review of Proposals
RFP 9-1356 On-Call Materials Testing and Inspection Services for Facilities Projects
Presented to Transit Committee - November 14, 2019

10 proposals were received, 3 firms were interviewed, 1 firm is being recommended.

Overall Ranking	Overall Score	Firm & Location	Subcontractors	Evaluation Committee Comments	Total Price
1	85	Ninyo & Moore Geotechnical & Environmental Science Consultants Irvine, California	Asset Laboratories Franklin Inspection Services	Highest-ranked firm overall. Firm has extensive experience providing materials testing and inspection services for public agency facilities projects of similar size and scope, including for the Orange County Transportation Authority (OCTA). Proposed key personnel, project manager (PM) and technical advisor/quality assurance/quality control, have over 20 years experience in the same/similar roles. Support personnel have relevant qualifications and experience on many public agency facilities projects. Work plan described sequential activities for implementation of services. Detailed discussion regarding quality, budget, and schedule control. Discussion of awareness of unforeseen issues and recommended solutions. Proposed response timelines meet scope of work requirements. Responsive, cohesive interview with organized, detailed, and thorough responses to all interview questions. Positive references. Proposed competitive price.	\$461,465
2	81	SCST, LLC Newport Beach, California	None	Firm has extensive experience providing materials testing and inspection services for public agency facilities projects of similar size and scope. Proposed key personnel are qualified and have relevant experience providing services on public agency facilities projects. PM has provided project management services on two projects. Support personnel have relevant qualifications and experience on many public agency facilities projects. Discussion of awareness of unforeseen issues and recommended solutions. Proposed response timelines meet scope of work requirements. Responsive, cohesive interview with organized, detailed, and thorough responses to all interview questions. Positive references. Proposed competitive price.	\$453,147
3	78	MTGL, Inc. Anaheim, California	None	Firm has relevant experience providing materials testing and inspection services for public agency projects, including two with OCTA. Proposed qualified and experienced key and support personnel. Support personnel have relevant qualifications and experience on many public agency facilities projects. Work plan was generic in some areas though did include a scope of work for potential project tests and inspections. Proposal included typical response time that were longer than project requirements. Proposer clarified at interview that timelines will be met upon request. Firm was responsive to interview questions though limited input by some key personnel. Positive references. Proposed lowest price.	\$370,596

Evaluation Panel (5 members)

Internal:
Contracts Administration and Materials Management (1)
Facilities Engineering (1)
Transit Maintenance-Specialty Shops (1)
Project Controls (1)
Real Property (1)

Evaluation Criteria

Qualifications of the Firm
Staffing and Project Organization
Work Plan
Cost and Price

Weight Factors

30 percent
20 percent
20 percent
30 percent