

Review of Proposals
RFP 9-0995 On-Call Real Property Appraisals and Related Services
Presented to Regional Planning and Highways Committee - September 5, 2019
13 proposals were received, 5 firms were interviewed, 4 firms are being recommended

Overall Ranking	Overall Score	Firm & Location	Subcontractors	Evaluation Committee Comments	Weighted Average Hourly Rate
1	85	Hendrickson Appraisal Company, Inc. San Diego, California	Donna Desmond Associates VAP Enterprises Crockett & Associates	Firm has 33 years of experience appraising all types of commercial, industrial, and residential properties for large, multi-parcel infrastructure projects. Firm has experience providing appraisal services for government agencies, including San Diego Association of Governments, California Department of Transportation (Caltrans), cities, counties, and utility companies. Proposed project manager has over 35 years of appraisal experience primarily oriented toward right-of-way (ROW) appraisals. Proposed project team has an average of 20 years of experience and have worked on projects of similar size and scope. Demonstrated an understanding of the appraisal process as a whole and described the quality control/quality assurance measures the firm implements for every project, including project manager involvement at every stage of the assignment. Demonstrated previous experience working with Caltrans appraisal reviewers and a thorough understanding of the Caltrans ROW manual. Presented an in-depth technical approach and provided detailed responses to questions during the interview.	\$222
2	83	Hennessey & Hennessey, LLC Tustin, California	Easley & Associates Hawran & Malm, LLC Desmond, Marcello & Amster, LLC Hodges, Lacey & Associates, LLC Donna Desmond Associates Document All Stars	Firm has 40 years of experience providing real estate appraisal, appraisal for eminent domain, appraisal of properties for negotiated acquisitions surplus property dispositions, appraisal review, and consulting services. Firm has experience providing appraisal services for government agencies, including Orange County Transportation Authority (OCTA), cities of Anaheim and Santa Ana, and Riverside County Transportation Commission (RCTC). Proposed project manager has over 30 years of real property appraisal experience with an emphasis on eminent domain and litigation appraisals. Proposed project team has ten to 30 years of experience and have worked on projects of similar size and scope. Demonstrated an understanding of the appraisal process as a whole and described the quality control/quality assurance the firm implements for every project, including the use of subcontractant for proof reading. Demonstrated previous experience working with Caltrans appraisal reviewers and a thorough understanding of the Caltrans ROW manual. Presented an in-depth technical approach and provided detailed responses to questions during the interview.	\$255
2	83	Integra Realty Resources - Los Angeles Encino, California	Donna Desmond Associates Hodges, Lacey & Associates, LLC Keith Settle and Company The Recht and Recht Company	Firm has 20 years of experience providing appraisal services for real property in addition to specialty property types such as auto dealerships, parking structures, agricultural property, waterfront property, and residential estates. Firm has experience providing appraisal services for government agencies, including OCTA, Los Angeles Metropolitan Transportation Authority (Metro), RCTC, County of Los Angeles, and Caltrans. Proposed project manager has over 35 years of appraisal experience specializing in valuation and consulting services related to public agency clients for office, industrial, retail, multifamily, and special purpose properties. Proposed project team includes 13 appraisers that have worked on projects of similar size and scope. Demonstrated an understanding of the appraisal process as a whole and described the firm's Excel master tracking spreadsheet for quality control/quality assurance to ensure projects are delivered on time. Demonstrated a thorough understanding of compliance with the Caltrans ROW manual. Presented an in-depth technical approach and provided detailed responses to questions during the interview.	\$302
3	77	R.P. Laurain & Associates, Inc. Long Beach, California	Hodges, Lacey & Associates, LLC Donna Desmond Associates	Firm has 50 years of experience providing real estate appraisal services involving ROW projects, full and partial acquisition studies, and special use private and public properties. Firm has experience providing appraisal services for government agencies, including OCTA, Caltrans, Port of Long Beach, California High-Speed Rail, Metro, San Bernardino County Transportation Authority, and various cities. Proposed project manager has over 33 years of real estate appraisal experience, including eminent domain studies, street widening, grade separation, freeway projects, railroad projects, relocation studies, and leasing of publicly-owned properties. Proposed project team 14 years of experience in market research and real estate appraisal. Demonstrated an understanding of the appraisal process as a whole and described the firm's Excel master tracking spreadsheet for quality control/quality assurance to ensure projects are delivered on time. Demonstrated previous experience working with Caltrans appraisal reviewers and a thorough understanding of the Caltrans ROW manual. Presented an in-depth technical approach and provided detailed responses to questions during the interview.	\$207

Evaluation Panel: Five Members

Internal:
Contracts Administration and Materials Management (1)
Real Property (2)
Metrolink Expansion (1)
External:
Caltrans (1)

Evaluation Criteria:

Qualifications of the Firm
Staffing and Project Organization
Work Plan
Cost and Price

Weight Factors

30%
25%
20%
25%