

Review of Proposals
RFP 8-1911 Independent Annual Financial Auditing Services
 Presented to Finance and Administration Committee - January 9, 2019
 10 proposals were received, 3 firms were interviewed, 1 firm is being recommended

Overall Ranking	Proposal Score	Firm & Location	Sub-Contractors	Evaluation Committee Comments	Total Firm Fixed Price for the Initial Term
1	92	Crowe, LLP Costa Mesa, California	None	Highest-ranked firm overall. Experience in auditing government agencies. Proposed lead engagement partner has 19 years of auditing experience. Proposed experienced 16-person audit team. Detailed its approach for completing each task and producing deliverables. Demonstrated an understanding of the requirements included in the scope of work. Included quality control reviews to ensure accuracy and included a timeline for delivering final reports. Included transition plan and the use of a web-based project management solution for facilitating communication. Presented approach and answered questions during the interview. Received positive responses from references. Proposed the lowest total firm-fixed price.	\$888,300.00
2	89	Macias, Gini & O'Connell, LLP Newport Beach, California	None	Second-ranked firm overall. Experience in auditing government agencies. Proposed lead engagement partner has 23 years of auditing experience. Proposed experienced 12-person audit team. Detailed its approach for completing each task and producing deliverables. Demonstrated an understanding of the requirements included in the scope of work. Included quality control reviews to ensure accuracy and included a timeline for delivering final reports. Presented approach and answered questions during the interview. Received positive responses from references. Proposed a competitive total firm-fixed price.	\$1,000,200.00
3	88	Vavrinek, Trine, Day & Company, LLP Laguna Hills, California	None	Third-ranked firm overall. Experience in auditing government agencies. Proposed lead engagement partner has 20 years of auditing experience. Proposed experienced 15-person audit team. Detailed its approach for completing each task and producing deliverables. Demonstrated an understanding of the requirements included in the scope of work. Included quality control reviews to ensure accuracy and included a timeline for delivering final reports. Presented approach and answered questions during the interview. Received positive responses from references. Proposed a competitive total firm-fixed price.	\$998,520.00

Evaluation Panel:

Internal
 Contracts Administration and Materials Management (1)
 Internal Audit (1)
 Accounting and Financial Reporting (1)

External
 Los Angeles-San Diego-San Luis Obispo Corridor Rail Agency (1)
 Taxpayer and Oversight Committee (1)

Proposal Criteria

Qualifications of the Firm
 Staffing and Project Organization
 Work Plan
 Cost and Price

Weight Factors

25%
 30%
 20%
 25%