

## **ATTACHMENT A**

**Review of Proposals  
RFP 8-1683 Beach Boulevard Corridor Study**

Presented to Regional Planning and Highways Committee - September 6, 2018  
Six firms proposed; three firms were interviewed; one firm is being recommended

| Overall Ranking | Proposal Score | Firm & Location   | Sub-Contractors  | Evaluation Committee Comments  | Total Firm-Fixed Price |
|-----------------|----------------|---|--|--|------------------------|
| 1               | 88             | Kittelson & Associates, Inc.<br>Orange, California        | Albert Grover & Associates<br>Arelano Associates<br>Leslie Scott Consulting<br>Opitians Civil Engineering<br>Steer Davies Gleave | Highest-ranked firm overall.<br>Experience with corridor planning, including complete streets.<br>Proposed to utilize a mix of subcontractors with different expertise.<br>Proposed project manager has 21 years of planning and engineering experience.<br>Proposed project team consists of transportation planners, transportation engineers, urban planners, and community liaisons.<br>Detailed its approach for completing each task and producing deliverables.<br>Demonstrated an understanding of the Beach Boulevard corridor, as well as the various stakeholders along the corridor.<br>Demonstrated an understanding of the California Department of Transportation.<br>Proposed solutions and enhancements.<br>Presented approach and answered questions during the interview.<br>Received positive responses from references.<br>Proposed a competitive total firm-fixed price. | \$439,989              |
| 2               | 85             | HDR Engineering, Inc.<br>Irvine, California               | Arelano Associates<br>IBI Group  | Second-ranked firm.<br>Experience in corridor studies, active transportation, and complete streets.<br>Proposed to utilize subcontractors to provide additional support.<br>Proposed project manager has 38 years of experience with transportation corridor and traffic engineering projects.<br>Proposed project team has experience in transportation analysis, planning and design, transportation engineering, and public outreach.<br>Discussed approach for performing the study.<br>Demonstrated an understanding of the Beach Boulevard corridor.<br>Did not expand on active transportation discussions; mostly focused on vehicular solutions.<br>Presented approach and answered questions during the interview.<br>Received positive responses from references.<br>Proposed the lowest total firm-fixed price.  | \$435,150              |
| 3               | 79             | ADVANTEC Consulting Engineers, Inc.<br>Irvine, California | Counts Unlimited, Inc.<br>Fehr and Peers<br>Rock E. Miller & Associates  | Experience with multimodal transportation planning, engineering, and technology services.<br>Proposed to utilize subcontractors to provide additional support.<br>Proposed project manager has 29 years of experience in transportation systems and traffic engineering.<br>Proposed project team has experience in transportation engineering, transportation planning, and traffic engineering.<br>Discussed approach for performing the study.<br>Demonstrated an understanding of the Beach Boulevard corridor.<br>Did not elaborate on approach for engaging stakeholders and technical working group.<br>Presented approach and answered questions during the interview.<br>Received positive responses from references.<br>Proposed a competitive total firm fixed price.   | \$441,055              |

| Evaluation Panel:                           | Proposal Criteria                 | Weight Factors |
|---|-----------------------------------|----------------|
| Internal:                                   | Qualifications of the Firm        | 25%            |
|   | Staffing and Project Organization | 25%            |
| Transportation Planning (1)                 | Work Plan                         | 30%            |
| External:                                   | Cost and Price                    | 20%            |
| California Department of Transportation (1) |                                   |                |
| City of Anaheim (1)                         |                                   |                |
| City of Buena Park (1)                      |                                   |                |
| City of Westminster (1)                     |                                   |                |