

Review of Proposals
RFP 0-2178 Graphic Design Services For Bus Service Change Materials
 Presented to Legislative and Communications Committee - June 18, 2020
 5 proposals were received, 3 firms were interviewed, 1 firm is being recommended.

Overall Ranking	Proposal Score	Firm & Location	Sub-Contractors	Evaluation Committee Comments	Weighted Average Hourly Rate
1	86	Digital Graphics Centre Fullerton, California	None	Highest-ranked firm overall. Experience with graphic design projects. Provided graphic design services to OCTA. Proposed project manager has 30 years of experience. Proposed project team is knowledgeable with relevant experience. Discussed approach for each element, including using Apple InDesign platform, using Smart Styles plug-in to link excel files to create bus service change materials. Proposed to leverage experience working with and knowledge of OCTA. Demonstrated an understanding of the project schedule. Proposed lowest weighted average hourly rate.	\$49
2	58	Art Machine Los Angeles, California	Graphic Trends Primary Color Lithographix Colonet Press	Second-ranked firm. Experience with graphic design projects. Proposed to utilize four subcontractors for this project. Proposed project manager has eight years of experience. Proposed account supervisor has over ten years of experience. Proposed project team has relevant experience The firm's approach was basic and addressed similar projects with the Santa Monica transit, but was not able to adapt their experience to OCTA's project requirements. The firm mentioned in their interview that they had experience using different application from the Apple InDesign platform, but did not make a reference to knowing how to use the Smart Styles plug-in to link excel files to create bus service change materials. Proposed significantly higher rates from the lowest to highest range of \$46 to \$158, they were in third place.	\$103.45
3	55	Mix Marketing, LLC San Juan Capistrano, California	Primary Color	Experience with graphic design projects. Proposed subcontractor has graphic design experience. Proposed project manager has 15 years of experience. Proposed project team has relevant experience. During the interview the firm addressed past similar projects with the Irvine Company's maps for the iShuttle transportation service maps and Catalina Island Chamber of Commerce visitors guide and pocket map, but was not able to adapt their experience to our scope of work. During the interview the firm stated they had experience using the different applications from the Apple InDesign platform, but were not certain they would be able to use the Smart Styles plug-in to link excel files to create bus service change materials. Proposed significantly higher rates from the lowest to highest range of \$46 to \$158, they were in fourth place.	\$115

Evaluation Panel:

- Contracts Administration and Materials Management (1)
- Marketing and Customer Engagement (1)
- Vanpool Program (1)
- General Services (1)
- Scheduling and Bus Operations Support (1)

Proposal Criteria

- Qualifications of the Firm
- Staffing and Project Organization
- Work Plan
- Cost and Price

Weight Factors

- 25%
- 25%
- 25%
- 25%